

# 4D Variational Data Assimilation with Incompact3d using Large Eddy Models

Pranav Chandramouli

# ▶ To cite this version:

Pranav Chandramouli. 4D Variational Data Assimilation with Incompact3d using Large Eddy Models . Incompact3d Meeting 2018, Mar 2018, London, United Kingdom. hal-01764622

# HAL Id: hal-01764622 https://inria.hal.science/hal-01764622

Submitted on 12 Apr 2018

**HAL** is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

# 4D Variational Data Assimilation with Incompact3d using Large Eddy Models

### Pranav CHANDRAMOULI Supervised by: Etienne MEMIN & Dominique HEITZ

INRIA - Rennes (Fluminance) Incompact3d Meeting - London, 2018

28/03/2018

▲ □ ▶ ▲ □ ▶ ▲ □ ▶

GS Models ES - Results





LES - Results

### 2 Data Assimilation

- Introduction to Data Assimilation
- Code Formulation
- VDA with LES Results

SGS Models LES - Results

# Objective

# To Identify an apt Sub-Grid Scale (SGS) model for coarse LES in terms of statistical accuracy and numerical stability.

SGS Models LES - Results

### LES - SGS Models

Smagorinsky Variants :

$$Classic: \nu_t = (C_s * \Delta)^2 \bar{S}, \qquad (1)$$

$$Dynamic: C_s^2 = -\frac{1}{2} \frac{\mathscr{L}_{ij} \bar{M}_{ij}}{M_{kl} \bar{M}_{kl}}.$$
 (2)

where,

$$\mathscr{L}_{ij} = T_{ij} - \tilde{\tau}_{ij} \tag{3}$$

$$M_{ij} = \tilde{\Delta}^2 |\tilde{\bar{S}}| \tilde{\bar{S}}_{ij} - \bar{\Delta}^2 (\widetilde{|\bar{S}|\bar{S}_{ij}}), \tag{4}$$

WALE :

$$\nu_t = (C_w \Delta)^2 \frac{(\varsigma_{ij}^d \varsigma_{ij}^d)^{3/2}}{(\bar{S}_{ij} \bar{S}_{ij})^{5/2} + (\varsigma_{ij}^d \varsigma_{ij}^d)^{5/4}}$$
(5)

Large Eddy Simulation SGS Data Assimilation LES -

#### SGS Models LES - Results

# LES - Models under Location Uncertainty (MULU)

$$\frac{\mathrm{d}\mathbf{X}_{t}}{\mathrm{d}t} = \boldsymbol{w}(\mathbf{X}_{t}, t) + \sigma(\mathbf{X}_{t}, t)\dot{\mathbf{B}}$$
(6)

- w(X, t) is the large scale drift
- $\sigma(\mathbf{X}, t) d\mathbf{\dot{B}}_t$  stands for small scales represented by a noise

Mémin, Etienne. "Fluid flow dynamics under location uncertainty." Geophysical & Astrophysical Fluid Dynamics 108.2 (2014) : 119-146.

# MULU

NS formulation as derived in Memin [2014] :

### Mass conservation :

$$d_t \rho_t + \nabla \cdot (\rho \tilde{\boldsymbol{w}}) dt + \nabla \rho \cdot \boldsymbol{\sigma} d\boldsymbol{B}_t = \frac{1}{2} \nabla \cdot (\boldsymbol{a} \nabla q) dt, \qquad (7)$$

$$\tilde{\boldsymbol{w}} = \boldsymbol{w} - \frac{1}{2} \boldsymbol{\nabla} \cdot \boldsymbol{a}$$
 (8)

For an incompressible fluid :

$$\nabla \cdot (\sigma d \boldsymbol{B}_t) = 0, \quad \nabla \cdot \tilde{\boldsymbol{w}} = 0,$$
 (9)

Momentum conservation :

$$\left(\partial_t \boldsymbol{w} + \boldsymbol{w} \boldsymbol{\nabla}^T (\boldsymbol{w} - \frac{1}{2} \boldsymbol{\nabla} \cdot \boldsymbol{a}) - \frac{1}{2} \sum_{ij} \partial_{x_i} (\boldsymbol{a}_{ij} \partial_{x_j} \boldsymbol{w}) \right) \rho = \rho \boldsymbol{g} - \boldsymbol{\nabla} \boldsymbol{p} + \mu \Delta \boldsymbol{w}.$$

SGS Models LES - Results

### MULU

Modelling of *a* :

Stochastic Smagorinsky model (StSm) :

$$\boldsymbol{a}(\boldsymbol{x},t) = C||\boldsymbol{S}||\mathbb{I}_3, \tag{11}$$

< ロ > < 同 > < 回 > < 回 > .

Local variance based models (StSp / StTe) :

$$\boldsymbol{a}(\boldsymbol{x}, n\delta t) = \frac{1}{|\Gamma| - 1} \sum_{x_i \in \eta(x)} (\boldsymbol{w}(x_i, n\delta t) - \bar{\boldsymbol{w}}(x, n\delta t)) (\boldsymbol{w}(x_i, n\delta t) - \bar{\boldsymbol{w}}(x, n\delta t))^T C_{st},$$
(12)

7 / 29

三日 わへの

SGS Models LES - Results

### **Channel Flow**



Velocity fluctuation profiles for turbulent channel flow at  $\text{Re}_{ au} = 395$ 

	$n_x \times n_y \times n_z$	$l_x  imes l_y  imes l_z$	$\Delta x$	$\Delta y$	$\Delta z$	$\Delta t$
cLES	48×81×48	6.28×2×3.14	0.13	0.005-0.12	0.065	0.002
Ref	256×257×256	$6.28{ imes}2{ imes}3.14$	0.024	0.0077	0.012	-

イロト イヨト イヨト イヨト

SGS Models LES - Results

### Wake Flow



< u'u' > profile in the streamwise direction on the centre-line behind the cylinder.

Re	$\mathbf{n}_x \times \mathbf{n}_y \times \mathbf{n}_z$	$I_x/D \times I_y/D \times I_z/D$	$\Delta x/D$	$\Delta y/D$	$\Delta z/D$	$U\Delta t/D$
3900	241×241×48	20×20×3.14	0.083	0.024-0.289	0.065	0.003
3900	$160{\times}128{\times}1$	3.6×2.9×-	0.023	0.023	-	0.01
3900	$1537{\times}1025{\times}96$	20×20×3.14	0.013	0.0056-0.068	0.033	0.00075
	Re 3900 3900 3900	$\begin{tabular}{ c c c c c } \hline Re & n_x \times n_y \times n_z \\ \hline 3900 & 241 \times 241 \times 48 \\ \hline 3900 & 160 \times 128 \times 1 \\ \hline 3900 & 1537 \times 1025 \times 96 \\ \hline \end{tabular}$	$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $	$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $	$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $	Re $n_x \times n_y \times n_z$ $l_x/D \times l_y/D \times l_z/D$ $\Delta x/D$ $\Delta y/D$ $\Delta z/D$ 3900         241×241×48         20×20×3.14         0.083         0.024-0.289         0.065           3900         160×128×1         3.6×2.9×-         0.023         0.023         -           3900         1537×1025×96         20×20×3.14         0.013         0.0056-0.068         0.033

Pranav CHANDRAMOULI

4D-Var with LES - Incompact3d Meeting

Introduction to Data Assimilation Code Formulation VDA with LES - Results

### Plan



### 2 Data Assimilation

- Introduction to Data Assimilation
- Code Formulation
- VDA with LES Results

イロト (母) (ヨト (ヨト )ヨヨ うのつ

Introduction to Data Assimilation Code Formulation VDA with LES - Results

# Objective

An efficient method to incorporate Experimental Fluid Dynamics (EFD) as a guiding mechanism within Computational Fluid Dynamics (CFD) (Data Assimilation) - within the realm of Large Eddy Simulations (LES).

< ロ > < 同 > < 目 > < 目 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □

11/29

Introduction to Data Assimilation Code Formulation VDA with LES - Results

# Data Assimilation - Types

- Sequential approach : Cuzol and Mémin (2009), Colburn et al. (2011), Kato and Obayashi (2013), Combes et al. (2015)
- Variational approach (VDA) : Papadakis and Mémin (2009), Suzuki et al. (2009), Heitz et al. (2010), Lemke and Sesterhenne (2013), Gronskis et al. (2013), Dovetta et al. (2014)
- Hybrid approach : Yang (2014)

・ロト ・母 ト ・ヨト ・ヨト ・ション ション

Introduction to Data Assimilation Code Formulation VDA with LES - Results

# VDA - General Formulation

**Objective** : Estimate the unknown true state of interest  $\mathbf{x}^{t}(t, x)$ Formulation :

$$\partial_t \mathbf{x}(t,x) + \mathbb{M}(\mathbf{x}(t,x)) = \mathbf{q}(t,x),$$
 (13)

$$\boldsymbol{x}(t_0, \boldsymbol{x}) = \boldsymbol{x}_0^b + \boldsymbol{\eta}(\boldsymbol{x}) \tag{14}$$

$$\boldsymbol{\mathcal{Y}}(t,x) = \mathbb{H}(\boldsymbol{x}(t,x)) + \boldsymbol{\epsilon}(t,x)$$
(15)

q(t, x) - model error (Covariance matrix **Q**)  $\eta(x)$  - background error (Covariance matrix **B**)  $\epsilon(t, x)$  - observation error (Covariance matrix **R**)

ショク エーニー

Introduction to Data Assimilation Code Formulation VDA with LES - Results

### VDA - General Formulation

Cost Function :

$$J(\mathbf{x}_{0}) = \frac{1}{2} (\mathbf{x}_{0} - \mathbf{x}_{0}^{b})^{T} \mathbf{B}^{-1} (\mathbf{x}_{0} - \mathbf{x}_{0}^{b}) + \frac{1}{2} \int_{t_{0}}^{t_{f}} (\mathbb{H}(\mathbf{x}_{t}) - \mathcal{Y}(t))^{T} \mathbf{R}^{-1} (\mathbb{H}(\mathbf{x}_{t}) - \mathcal{Y}(t)).$$
(16)

< □ > < □ > < Ξ > < Ξ > < Ξ ≥ < Ξ = の Q @

14 / 29

Introduction to Data Assimilation Code Formulation VDA with LES - Results

### 4DVar - Adjoint Method



Evolution of the state of interest  $(x_0)$  as a function of time

$$\frac{\partial J}{\partial \eta} = -\lambda(\mathbf{t}_{o}) + \mathbf{B}^{-1}(\partial \mathbf{x}(\mathbf{t}_{0}) - \partial \mathbf{x}_{0}).$$
(17)

Le Dimet, Francois-Xavier, and Olivier Talagrand. "Variational algorithms for analysis and assimilation of meteorological observations : theoretical aspects." Tellus A : Dynamic Meteorology and Oceanography 38.2 (1986) : 97-110.

Introduction to Data Assimilation Code Formulation VDA with LES - Results

### 4DVar - Incremental Optimisation



Evolution of the cost function  $(J(x_0))$  as a function of time

Courtier, P., J. N. Thépaut, and Anthony Hollingsworth. "A strategy for operational implementation of 4D-Var, using an incremental approach." Quarterly Journal of the Royal Meteorological Society 120.519 (1994): 1367-1387.

16/29

Introduction to Data Assimilation Code Formulation VDA with LES - Results

# Additional Control

Minimisation of J with respect to additional incremental control parameter  $\delta u : \delta \gamma^{(i)} = \{\delta \mathbf{x_0^{(i)}}, \delta \mathbf{u^{(i)}}\}$ 

$$J(\delta\gamma^{(i)}) = \frac{1}{2} ||\delta \mathbf{x_0^{(i)}} + \mathbf{x_0^{(i)}} - \mathbf{x_0^{(b)}}||_{\mathbf{B}^{-1}}^2 + \frac{1}{2} \int_{t_0}^{t_f} ||\delta \mathbf{u^{(i)}} + \mathbf{u^{(i)}} - \mathbf{u^{(b)}}||_{\mathbf{B}_c}^2 + \dots$$
(18)

constrained by :

$$\partial_t \delta \mathbf{x}^{(i)} + \partial_{\mathbf{x}} \mathbb{M}(\mathbf{x}^{(i)}) \cdot \partial \mathbf{x}^{(i)} + \partial_{\mathbf{u}} \mathbb{M}(\mathbf{u}^{(i)}) \cdot \partial \mathbf{u}^{(i)} = \mathbf{0}$$
(19)

▲冊▶ ▲ヨ▶ ▲ヨ▶ ヨヨ わへや

Introduction to Data Assimilation Code Formulation VDA with LES - Results

### 4DVar - Flow Chart



4DVar incremental Data Assimilation using Adjoint methodology.

Introduction to Data Assimilation Code Formulation VDA with LES - Results

# Incompact3d (Laizet et al. 2010) - DNS



◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆三▶ ◆三▶ ●□= シQ@

19/29

Introduction to Data Assimilation Code Formulation VDA with LES - Results

### Incompact3d (Laizet et al. 2010) - LES



20 / 29

▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ■□ のQで

Introduction to Data Assimilation Code Formulation VDA with LES - Results

### Synthetic Assimilation at Re 3900



Optimisation Parameter -  $U(x, y, z, t_0)$ Control Parameters -  $U_{in}(1, y, z, t)$  $C_{st}(x, y, z)$ 

イロト イボト イヨト イヨト

	Re	$\mathbf{n}_x \times \mathbf{n}_y \times \mathbf{n}_z$	$I_x/D \times I_y/D \times I_z/D$	$U\Delta t/D$	Duration
Full Domain	3900	361×361 <sup>s</sup> ×48	20×20×3.14	0.003	$40100\Delta t$
Observation	3900	$145^{i} \times 145^{i} \times 48$	6×6×3.14	0.003	$100\Delta t$
4DVAR	3900	$145{ imes}145{ imes}48$	6×6×3.14	0.003	$100\Delta t$

s - Stretched ; i - Interpolated

Introduction to Data Assimilation Code Formulation VDA with LES - Results

### Background Velocity - Biased



 $+ \sin y^3$  noise



3 x 3

ъ.

Introduction to Data Assimilation Code Formulation VDA with LES - Results

### Assimilated Velocity

### Background





### 4DVAR Algorithm



### Assimilated

Image: Image:

315

★ 3 → < 3</p>

Introduction to Data Assimilation Code Formulation VDA with LES - Results

### Collated Results - Initial Condition Correction



#### REFERENCE

Pranav CHANDRAMOULI

4D-Var with LES - Incompact3d Meeting

-

VDA with LES - Results

### LES Coefficient Estimation - Preliminary Results





#### BACKGROUND



#### OBSERVATION



#### BACKGROUND



ASSIMILATED



2 3 4 5 4

0 1 2 3 4 3



#### ASSIMILATED









Image: Image:

Introduction to Data Assimilation Code Formulation VDA with LES - Results

# Conclusions

- Efficient cost reduction is possible using LES with VDA
- An improvement on the background is obtained using LES based VDA
- An estimation of the LES coefficient can be obtained using VDA

▲ □ ▶ ▲ □ ▶ ▲ □ ▶

Introduction to Data Assimilation Code Formulation VDA with LES - Results

# Future Work

- Perform LES DA with experimental data
- Use sliding windows in VDA
- Include outlet condition in optimisation algorithm
- Assimilate over a larger temporal domain

・ 同 ト ・ ヨ ト ・ ヨ ト

E SQC

27 / 29

Introduction to Data Assimilation Code Formulation VDA with LES - Results

## References

- P. Chandramouli, E. Memin, D. Heitz, and S. Laizet. Coarse large-eddy simulations in a transitional wake flow with flow models under location uncertainty. Comput. Fluids, 168 :170-189, 2018.
- P. Chandramouli, E. Memin, D. Heitz, and S. Laizet. A Comparative Study of LES Models Under Location Uncertainty. In Proceedings of the Congrés Français de Mécanique., 2017b.
- P. Chandramouli, E. Memin, and D. Heitz. 4d Turbulent Wake Reconstruction using Large Eddy Simulation based Variational Data Assimilation. Delft, Netherlands, 2017a.
- E. Memin. Fluid flow dynamics under location uncertainty. Geophys. Astro. Fluid, 108(2) : 119-146, March 2014.
- A. Gronskis, D. Heitz, and E. Memin. Inflow and initial conditions for direct numerical simulation based on adjoint data assimilation. J. Comput. Phys., 242 :480-497, June 2013.

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆三▶ ◆三▶ ●□= ◇Qペ

Large Eddy Simulation Data Assimilation VDA with LES - Results

### Thanks for your attention

・ロト (個) (E) (E) (E) (E)

### Reference - Synthetic Velocity Fields



### Models under Location Uncertainty

Modelling of *a* :

Stochastic Smagorinsky model (StSm) :

$$\boldsymbol{a}(\boldsymbol{x},t) = C||\boldsymbol{S}||\mathbb{I}_3, \tag{20}$$

Local variance based models (StSp / StTe) :

$$\boldsymbol{a}(\boldsymbol{x}, n\delta t) = \frac{1}{|\Gamma| - 1} \sum_{x_i \in \eta(x)} (\boldsymbol{w}(x_i, n\delta t) - \bar{\boldsymbol{w}}(x, n\delta t)) (\boldsymbol{w}(x_i, n\delta t) - \bar{\boldsymbol{w}}(x, n\delta t))^T C_{sp},$$
(21)

2/19







Pranav CHANDRAMOULI 4D-Var with LES - Incompact3d Meeting

・ロト ・回ト ・ヨト ・ヨト

### Flow Solver - Incompact3d



- Fortran based parallelised flow solver 2Decomp & FFT (Laizet S. & Lamballais E. (2009))
- Simulates the incompressible Navier Stokes equations
- Spectral pressure treatment with collocated or staggered grid formulation

# Flow Specifications



Instantaneous streamwise velocity contour

	$n_x \times n_y \times n_z$	$I_x  imes I_y  imes I_z$	$\Delta x$	$\Delta y$	$\Delta z$	$\Delta t$
cLES	48×81×48	6.28×2×3.14	0.13	0.005-0.12	0.065	0.002
Ref	256×257×256	$6.28{ imes}2{ imes}3.14$	0.024	0.0077	0.012	-

ъ

### **Channel Flow Statistics**

### Mean Velocity Profile :



Mean velocity profile for turbulent channel flow at  $\text{Re}_{ au} = 395$ 

▲ 同 ▶ ▲ 国 ▶ ▲ 国

### **Channel Flow**



・ロン ・部 と ・ ヨン・

三日 のへの

### **Channel Flow**



Velocity fluctuation profiles for turbulent channel flow at  $\text{Re}_{ au} = 395$ 

▲ (日) ▶ ▲ (日)

三日 のへの

8/19

### **Channel Flow**



◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆三▶ ◆三▶ ◆□▼ ��

### **Channel Flow**



◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆三▶ ◆三▶ ◆□▼ ��







Pranav CHANDRAMOULI 4D-Var with LES - Incompact3d Meeting

・ロト ・四ト ・ヨト ・ヨト

### Flow Parameters



Re	$n_x \times n_y \times n_z$	$I_x/D \times I_y/D \times I_z/D$	$\Delta x/D$ $\Delta y$	$y/D$ $\Delta z/D$ $U\Delta t/D$
----	-----------------------------	-----------------------------------	-------------------------	----------------------------------

cLES	3900	$241{\times}241{\times}48$	20×20×3.14	0.083	0.024-0.289	0.065	0.003
PIV - Parn	3900	$160{ imes}128{ imes}1$	3.6×2.9×-	0.023	0.023	-	0.01
LES - Parn	3900	$961{ imes}961{ imes}48$	20×20×3.14	0.021	0.021	0.065	0.003
DNS	3900	$1537{\times}1025{\times}96$	20×20×3.14	0.013	0.0056-0.068	0.033	0.00075
DNJ	3500	1557 ~ 1025 ~ 50	20~20~3.14	0.015	0.0030-0.000	0.055	0.0007

< • • • **6** 

★ 문 ► ★ 문 ►

### Flow Statistics

### Centerline statistical comparison :



Mean streamwise velocity in the streamwise direction along the centerline behind the cylinder.



Fluctuating streamwise velocity in the streamwise direction along the centerline behind the cylinder.

▲ 伊 ▶ ▲ 王 ▶

ъ.

### Flow Statistics



・日・ ・ ヨト・

-

三日 のへの

14 / 19

### Flow Statistics



三日 のへの

### Vorticity Structures

Smagorinsky

### Stochastic Smagorinsky

### Stochastic Spatial





Wake Flow

Z/D

### Vorticity Structures

Z/D

Y/D 10 -

### Smagorinsky



### Stochastic Smagorinsky







ъ

### Simulation Cost

Model	$w/o \ model$	Smag	StSm	StSp
Computational Cost [s/iteration]	1.34	2.877	3.654	5.711

TABLE – Computational cost [s] per iteration for each model.

Cost of StSp under coarse resolution = 0.46% cost of DNS

▲母▶▲∃▶▲∃▶ ∃|= ののの

# 4D-Var with Incompact3d - DNS

19/19

伺 ト イヨト イヨト ヨヨー わえつ